

# COMPARATIVE ADMINISTRATIVE LAW

## RESEARCH HANDBOOKS IN COMPARATIVE LAW

**Series Editors:** Francesco Parisi, *Oppenheimer Wolff and Donnelly Professor of Law, University of Minnesota, USA* and Professor of Economics, *University of Bologna, Italy* and Tom Ginsburg, *Professor of Law, University of Chicago, USA*

The volumes in this series offer high-level discussion and analysis on particular aspects of legal systems and the law. Well-known scholars edit each handbook and bring together accessible yet sophisticated contributions from an international cast of top researchers. The first series of its kind to cover a wide range of comparative issues so comprehensively, this is an indispensable resource for students and scholars alike.

# Comparative Administrative Law

*Edited by*

**Susan Rose-Ackerman**

*Yale University, USA*

*and*

**Peter L. Lindseth**

*University of Connecticut, USA*

RESEARCH HANDBOOKS IN COMPARATIVE LAW

**Edward Elgar**

Cheltenham, UK • Northampton, MA, USA

© The Editors and Contributors Severally 2010

All rights reserved. No part of this publication may be reproduced, stored in a retrieval system or transmitted in any form or by any means, electronic, mechanical or photocopying, recording, or otherwise without the prior permission of the publisher.

Published by  
Edward Elgar Publishing Limited  
The Lypiatts  
15 Lansdown Road  
Cheltenham  
Glos GL50 2JA  
UK

Edward Elgar Publishing, Inc.  
William Pratt House  
9 Dewey Court  
Northampton  
Massachusetts 01060  
USA

A catalogue record for this book  
is available from the British Library

Library of Congress Control Number: 2010925944



ISBN 978 1 84844 635 9 (cased)  
ISBN 978 1 84844 642 7 (paperback)

Typeset by Servis Filmsetting Ltd, Stockport, Cheshire  
Printed and bound by MPG Books Group, UK

---

# Contents

---

<i>List of contributors</i>	viii
<i>Acknowledgements</i>	xviii

Comparative administrative law: an introduction	1
<i>Susan Rose-Ackerman and Peter L. Lindseth</i>	

## PART 1 HISTORICAL PERSPECTIVES

1 <i>Révolution, Rechtsstaat</i> and the Rule of Law: historical reflections on the emergence of administrative law in Europe	23
<i>Bernardo Sordi</i>	
2 Explaining administrative law: reflections on federal administrative law in nineteenth century America	37
<i>Jerry L. Mashaw</i>	
3 Testing Weber: compensation for public services, bureaucratization, and the development of positive law in the United States	47
<i>Nicholas Parrillo</i>	
4 Administrative law and the public regulation of markets in a global age	63
<i>Marco D'Alberti</i>	
5 Administrative law in East Asia: a comparative-historical analysis	78
<i>John Ohnesorge</i>	
6 Administrative state socialism and its constitutional aftermath	92
<i>Kim Lane Scheppele</i>	

## PART 2 CONSTITUTIONAL STRUCTURE AND ADMINISTRATIVE LAW

7 Written constitutions and the administrative state: on the constitutional character of administrative law	117
<i>Tom Ginsburg</i>	
8 Good-bye, Montesquieu	128
<i>Bruce Ackerman</i>	
9 Comparative positive political theory	134
<i>M. Elizabeth Magill and Daniel R. Ortiz</i>	
10 Overseeing the executive: Is the legislature reclaiming lost territory from the courts?	148
<i>Tom Zwart</i>	
11 'Creatures of the state': regulatory federalism, local immunities, and EU waste regulation in comparative perspective	161
<i>Fernanda G. Nicola</i>	

### PART 3 ADMINISTRATIVE INDEPENDENCE

- 12 The promise of comparative administrative law: a constitutional perspective on independent agencies 185  
*Daniel Halberstam*
- 13 The puzzle of administrative independence and parliamentary democracy in the common law world: a Canadian perspective 205  
*Lorne Sossin*
- 14 Presidential dominance from a comparative perspective: the relationship between the executive branch and regulatory agencies in Brazil 225  
*Mariana Mota Prado*
- 15 Experimenting with independent commissions in a new democracy with a civil law tradition: the case of Taiwan 246  
*Jiunn-rong Yeh*
- 16 Understanding independent accountability agencies 265  
*John M. Ackerman*
- 17 Independent administrative authorities in France: structural and procedural change at the intersection of Americanization, Europeanization and Gallicization 277  
*Dominique Custos*
- 18 A comparison of US and European independent agencies 293  
*Martin Shapiro*

### PART 4 TRANSPARENCY, PROCEDURE, AND ADMINISTRATIVE POLICY-MAKING

- 19 Comparing regulatory oversight bodies across the Atlantic: the Office of Information and Regulatory Affairs in the US and the Impact Assessment Board in the EU 309  
*Jonathan B. Wiener and Alberto Alemanno*
- 20 Towards a third generation of administrative procedure 336  
*Javier Barnes*
- 21 Participation and expertise: judicial attitudes in comparative perspective 357  
*Catherine Donnelly*
- 22 Administrative agencies as creators of administrative law norms: evidence from the UK, France and Sweden 373  
*Dorit Rubinstein Reiss*

### PART 5 ADMINISTRATIVE LITIGATION AND ADMINISTRATIVE LAW

- 23 The origins of American-style judicial review 389  
*Thomas W. Merrill*
- 24 The powers and duties of the French administrative judge 415  
*Jean Massot*

25	Judicial review and merits review: comparing administrative adjudication by courts and tribunals <i>Peter Cane</i>	426
26	Judicial review of questions of law: a comparative perspective <i>Paul Craig</i>	449
27	Judicial deference to legislative delegation and administrative discretion in new democracies: recent evidence from Poland, Taiwan, and South Africa <i>Cheng-Yi Huang</i>	466
28	Where too little judicial deference can impair the administrative process: the case of Ukraine <i>Howard N. Fenton</i>	482

## PART 6 ADMINISTRATIVE LAW AND THE BOUNDARIES OF THE STATE

### ***A. The Boundary between Public and Private***

29	Three questions of privatization <i>Daphne Barak-Erez</i>	493
30	Contracting out and ‘public values’: a theoretical and comparative approach <i>Jean-Bernard Auby</i>	511
31	Organizational structure, institutional culture and norm compliance in an era of privatization: the case of US military contractors <i>Laura A. Dickinson</i>	524
32	Financial crisis and bailout: legal challenges and international lessons from Mexico, Korea and the United States <i>Irma E. Sandoval</i>	543
33	The role of the State in (and after) the financial crisis: new challenges for administrative law <i>Giulio Napolitano</i>	569

### ***B. Administration Beyond the State: The Case of the European Union***

34	A restatement of European administrative law: problems and prospects <i>George A. Bermann</i>	595
35	Adversarial legalism and administrative law in the European Union <i>R. Daniel Kelemen</i>	606
36	Supranational governance and networked accountability structures: Member State oversight of EU agencies <i>Johannes Saurer</i>	618
37	Individual rights and transnational networks <i>Francesca Bignami</i>	632

	<i>Index</i>	639
--	--------------	-----

---

## Contributors

---

### Co-editors

**Peter L. Lindseth** is the Olimpiad S. Ioffe Professor of International and Comparative Law at the University of Connecticut School of Law and during the 2008-2009 academic year was Visiting Professor at Yale Law School. He has also taught at Princeton University, the European University Institute, and Columbia Law School, among other institutions. In addition, Professor Lindseth has served as a Chateaubriand Fellow at the French *Conseil d'Etat*. His research interests include the comparative history of the modern administrative state as well as the relationship of European integration to administrative governance on the national level. Among his books are *Power and Legitimacy: Reconciling Europe and the Nation-state* (2010), *Administrative Law of the European Union: Oversight* (2008), and *TransAtlantic Regulatory Co-operation: Legal Problems and Political Prospects* (co-editor with George A. Bermann and Matthias Herdegen) (2000). Professor Lindseth holds a BA and JD from Cornell and a Ph.D. in European History from Columbia University.

**Susan Rose-Ackerman** is the Henry R. Luce Professor of Jurisprudence (Law and Political Science) at Yale University and co-director of the Law School's Center for Law, Economics, and Public Policy. She has held fellowships from the Guggenheim Foundation and the Fulbright Commission and was a Visiting Research Fellow at the World Bank and a fellow at the Center for Advanced Study in the Behavioral Sciences, Stanford, CA. She has written widely on corruption, administrative law, and law and economics. Her most recent books are *Corruption and Government: Causes, Consequences and Reform* (1999; translated into 15 languages); *From Elections to Democracy: Building Accountable Government in Hungary and Poland* (2005); *Controlling Environmental Policy: The Limits of Public Law in Germany and the United States* (1995). She is the editor of: *International Handbook on the Economics of Corruption* (2006) and *Economics of Administrative Law* (2007). She holds a BA from Wellesley College and a Ph.D. in economics from Yale University.

### Authors

**Bruce Ackerman** is Sterling Professor of Law and Political Science at Yale, and the author of 15 books that have had a broad influence in political philosophy, constitutional law, and public policy. His major works include *Social Justice in the Liberal State* (1980) and his two-volume constitutional history, *We the People* (1991, 1999). His most recent books are *Before the Next Attack* (2006) and *The Decline and Fall of the American Republic* (2010). Professor Ackerman is a member of the American Law Institute and the American Academy of Arts and Sciences. He is a Commander of the French Order of Merit, and the recipient of the American Philosophical Society's Henry Phillips Prize for Lifetime Achievement in Jurisprudence. He received his BA from Harvard University and his LL.B. from Yale Law School.

**John M. Ackerman** is a professor at the Institute for Legal Research of the Universidad Nacional Autónoma de México (National Autonomous University of Mexico) as well as Vice President of the International Association of Administrative Law and Editor-in-chief of the *Mexican Law Review*. He received his MA and Ph.D. in Political Sociology from the University of California, Santa Cruz. Recent publications include: *Nuevos escenarios del derecho electoral: los retos de la reforma de 2007–2008* (IIJ-UNAM, 2009), *Más allá del acceso a la información: transparencia, rendición de cuentas y Estado de derecho* (2008) and *Organismos autónomos y democracia: el caso de México* (2009). He is also a bi-weekly columnist for the newsweekly *Proceso* and the daily *La Jornada* and a frequent contributor of op-ed pieces to leading media outlets in the United States.

**Alberto Alemanno** is Associate Professor of European Law at HEC Paris and a qualified attorney-at-law in New York since 2004. He holds LL.M. degrees from the College of Europe and Harvard Law School and a Ph.D. in International Law and Economics from Bocconi University, Milan. He is the Editor-in-chief of the *European Journal of Risk Regulation*.

**Jean-Bernard Auby** is Professor of Public Law at Sciences Po Paris and Director of the project: Mutations de l'Action Publique et du Droit Public (Changes in Governance and Public Law). He has been a visiting professor at the University of Rome, the University of Pennsylvania and Oxford University. From 1998 to 2005 he was the President of the French Local Government Law Association. He is the director of the 'Juris-Classeur Administratif' (administrative legal encyclopedia), of the periodical *Droit administratif* and of the Bruylant's 'Droit Administratif/Administrative Law' collection. His main publications are *Droit de l'urbanisme et la construction* (2008); *Droit des collectivités locales*, 4th edition, 2008; *Droit de la fonction publique*, 5th edition (2009); *Droit administratif des biens*, 4th edition (2007); *La globalisation, le droit et l'Etat* (2003); *La décentralisation et le droit* (2006).

**Daphne Barak-Erez** is Professor of Law and the Stewart and Judy Colton Chair of Law and Security at Tel-Aviv University. She is the Director of the Cegla Center for Interdisciplinary Research of the Law and is a member of the International Academy of Comparative Law and the American Law Institute. She was a Visiting Professor of Law at several universities, including Columbia, Stanford and Toronto. Her recent books include *Exploring Social Rights: Between Theory and Practice* (edited with Aeyal Gross, 2007), *Outlawed Pigs: Law, Religion and Culture in Israel* (2007) and *Administrative Law* (in Hebrew, 2010).

**Javier Barnes** is a professor and Head of the Department of Administrative Law at the University of Huelva, Spain. His research is focused on comparative and European administrative law. He has been a visiting professor in Germany, Italy, the United States, and throughout Latin America. He is founder and director of an international research project on contemporary administrative law ([www.globallawpress.org](http://www.globallawpress.org)). His most recent publications include the books *Transforming Administrative Procedure* (2008) and *Challenges and Reform of Administrative Law* (2006).

**George A. Bermann** is the Jean Monnet Professor of European Union Law and the Walter Gellhorn Professor of Law at Columbia University School of Law and the Director

of its European Legal Studies Center. He is a faculty member of Collège d'Europe (Bruges, Belgium) and the Law and Globalization Program of the University of Paris I and the Institut des Sciences of Politiques and is the Chief Reporter, ALI Restatement of the US Law of International Commercial Arbitration. He is the author or editor of: *Transnational Litigation* (2003); *Introduction to French Law* (2008); *Cases & Materials on EU Law* (3d. ed. 2010); *Transatlantic Regulatory Cooperation* (2001); *French Business Law in Translation* (2008); *The Administrative Law of the European Union* (2008); *WTO Law and Human Health and Safety* (2006); *WTO Law and Developing Countries* (2007); *Law and Governance in an Enlarged European Union* (2004).

**Francesca Bignami** is Professor of Law at George Washington University Law School. Her research focuses on EU governance, comparative privacy law, and comparative administrative law. Before joining the GWU faculty, she was Professor of Law at Duke University, where she also served as the director of the Center for European Studies. In 2006, she was Visiting Professor and John Harvey Gregory Lecturer on World Organization at Harvard Law School. She has also taught at a number of other universities in Europe and the United States, and has been a visiting fellow at Harvard University and NYU School of Law.

**Peter Cane** is Distinguished Professor of Law at the Australian National University College of Law. For 20 years until 1997 he taught at Corpus Christi College, Oxford. His research interests lie in the areas of public law (especially administrative law), the law of obligations (especially tort law) and legal theory (especially theories of responsibility). Publications include *The Anatomy of Tort Law* (1997), *Responsibility in Law and Morality* (2002), *Principles of Administrative Law: Legal Regulation of Governance* (2008, with Leighton McDonald) and *Administrative Tribunals and Adjudication* (2009). He is a Corresponding Fellow of the British Academy and a Fellow of the Academy of Social Sciences in Australia.

**Paul Craig** is Professor of English Law, St John's College, Oxford. His principal academic interests are EU law, administrative law, constitutional law, and comparative public law. He has taught and written on all these areas. Current projects include a forthcoming book on the legal and political impact of the Lisbon Treaty.

**Dominique Custos** is the Judge John D. Wessel Distinguished Professor of Law, Loyola University, New Orleans. She taught at her alma mater, the Sorbonne and in her native Guadeloupe before being appointed full professor (Professeure agrégée) at Caen University, in Normandy, France, and, she later joined Loyola Law School. She was a Fulbright visiting scholar at Columbia University. A first strand of her research combines administrative law, European law and comparative law, and it focuses on the evolution of regulatory frameworks in a context of liberalization and globalization. In the second strand of her scholarly endeavors, where comparative law, European Union law and French overseas law intersect, she tackles the questions of legal transplant and law and development in a post-colonial era through the study of the French Overseas Departments and the EU Outermost Regions.

**Marco D'Alberti** is Full Professor of Administrative Law at the Sapienza University of Rome, School of Law. He has previously taught, since 1978, at the Universities of

Camerino, Ancona and at the School of Political Science at Sapienza. He has been Visiting Scholar at the Universities of Cambridge, Harvard, Yale, and Visiting Professor at Columbia University and Paris II – Panthéon Assas. He has been Commissioner of the Italian Antitrust Authority from 1997 to 2004, and is a member of the International Academy of Comparative Law. He is the author and editor of numerous books and essays in administrative law, public regulation of markets and comparative law. His most recent book is *Poteri pubblici, mercati e globalizzazione* (2008). Among his recent essays: ‘La régulation économique en mutation’, *Revue du droit public* (2006); ‘Diritto pubblico dei mercati e analisi economica’, *Rivista del diritto commerciale* (2007); ‘Competition Law and Regulatory Reform’, in P. Pavlopoulos and S. Flogaitis (eds), *Multilevel Governance and Administrative Reform in the 21st Century* (2008). He has recently co-edited a book on Independent Agencies, *Arbitri dei mercati. Le autorità indipendenti e l’economia* (2010).

**Laura A. Dickinson** is Foundation Professor of Law at the Sandra Day O’Connor College of Law at Arizona State University (ASU), where she is Faculty Director of the school’s Center for Law and Global Affairs. Her work focuses on human rights, national security, foreign affairs privatization, and qualitative empirical approaches to international law. Professor Dickinson’s work has been published in the *American Journal of International Law*, the *Yale Journal of International Law*, the *Southern California Law Review*, the *William & Mary Law Review*, and the *NYU Journal of International Law and Politics*, among others. Her monograph, *Outsourcing War and Peace: Preserving Public Values in a World of Privatized Foreign Affairs*, is forthcoming in 2011. Prior to her appointment to ASU, Professor Dickinson served on the faculty at the University of Connecticut School of Law, and she was a Visiting Research Scholar and Visiting Professor at Princeton University in 2006–2007. She served as a senior policy advisor to Harold Hongju Koh, Assistant Secretary of State for Democracy, Human Rights, and Labor at the US Department of State, and is a former law clerk to US Supreme Court Justices Harry A. Blackmun and Stephen G. Breyer, and to Judge Dorothy Nelson of the 9th US Circuit Court of Appeals.

**Catherine Donnelly** is a Lecturer in Law at Trinity College, Dublin and a practising barrister at Blackstone Chambers, London and at the Law Library, Dublin. She is also the Principal Legal Advisor to the Northern Ireland Human Rights Commission on its Bill of Rights project. She is author of *Delegation of Governmental Power to Private Parties: A Comparative Perspective* (2007), editor of *De Smith’s Judicial Review* (Supplement, 2009 and 6th edition, 2007), and a contributor to A. Lester, D. Pannick and J. Herberg (eds), *Human Rights: Law and Practice* (2009). She has published in public law, EU law, human rights law and public procurement law and also practises in these areas. She was formerly a litigation associate at Davis, Polk & Wardwell, New York, and Tutorial Fellow of Wadham College and University Lecturer at the University of Oxford.

**Howard N. Fenton** is Professor of Law at Ohio Northern University and the founding Director of the Democratic Governance and Rule of Law LL.M. Program. He teaches comparative administrative law and the capstone rule of law seminar to LL.M. students. Since 1995 he has been a consultant and adviser on administrative law reform to former Soviet republics and Eastern European countries, including spending 14 months in Tbilisi, Georgia as chief of party for the USAID Rule of Law project. He

has written extensively on administrative law issues and conducted two studies for the Administrative Conference of the US on the functioning of American foreign trade agencies. He is currently co-editor-in-chief of West's Ohio Administrative Law Handbook and Agency Directory.

**Tom Ginsburg** is Professor of Law at the University of Chicago, where he works on comparative and international law from an interdisciplinary perspective. He holds BA, JD and Ph.D. degrees from the University of California at Berkeley. One of his books, *Judicial Review in New Democracies* (2003), won the C. Herman Pritchett Award from the American Political Science Association for best book on law and courts. He has served as a visiting professor at the University of Tokyo, Kyushu University, Seoul National University, the Interdisciplinary Center Herzliya, the University of Pennsylvania, and the University of Trento. He currently directs a project funded by the National Science Foundation to gather and analyze the constitutions of all independent nation-states since 1789. Before entering law teaching, he served as a legal advisor at the Iran-US Claims Tribunal, The Hague, Netherlands, and has consulted with numerous international development agencies and governments on legal and constitutional reform.

**Daniel Halberstam** is the Eric Stein Collegiate Professor of Law and Director of the European Legal Studies Program at the University of Michigan. He is currently Fellow at the Wissenschaftskolleg (Institute for Advanced Study), Berlin, and also holds a position as Professor of Law in the European Legal Studies Department at the College of Europe, Bruges. A graduate of Columbia College and Yale Law School, he worked as clerk to Supreme Court Justice David Souter and as judicial fellow for Judge Peter Jann, European Court of Justice. He also served as attorney advisor to the Chairman, US Federal Trade Commission and as attorney advisor in the Department of Justice, Office of Legal Counsel. Halberstam serves on the editorial advisory board of Cambridge Studies in European Law and Policy and the *Common Market Law Review*. His teaching and scholarship focus on comparative constitutional law and legal theory.

**Cheng-Yi Huang** is Assistant Research Professor of the Institutum Iurisprudentiae at the Academia Sinica (Taiwan). He received his JSD from the University of Chicago Law School. He won the Graduate Students Paper Competition by the American Bar Foundation in 2007. The award-winning article has been published in *Law & Social Inquiry*. His doctoral dissertation received Honorable Mention to the 2010 Dissertation Prize of the Law & Society Association. He served as president of the North American Taiwan Studies Association from 2007 to 2008. He has presented papers at conferences of the Law & Society Association, the American Political Science Association, the Midwest Political Science Association, among others. His research and teaching interests include comparative constitutionalism, administrative law, environmental law, judicial politics, legal anthropology, legal history, and democratic theories. He can be reached at [chengyi@gate.sinica.edu.tw](mailto:chengyi@gate.sinica.edu.tw).

**R. Daniel Kelemen** (Ph.D., Stanford University) is Associate Professor of Political Science and Director of the Center for European Studies at Rutgers University. His research focuses on European Union (EU) politics, regulation and law. Prior to coming to Rutgers, he was Fellow in Politics at Lincoln College, University of Oxford. He has been a Member of the Institute for Advanced Study, a Fulbright Fellow at the Centre

for European Policy Studies in Brussels and visiting fellow at Princeton University's Woodrow Wilson School. He is co-editor of the *Oxford Handbook of Law and Politics* (2008) and author of *The Rules of Federalism: Institutions and Regulatory Politics in the EU and Beyond* (2004) and more than 25 articles and book chapters on the EU.

**M. Elizabeth Magill** is Academic Associate Dean, Joseph Weintraub-Bank of America Distinguished Professor of Law, and Horace W. Goldsmith Research Professor at University of Virginia School of Law, where she has taught since 1997. She teaches and writes in the fields of administrative law and constitutional law. She is a graduate of Yale College and University of Virginia School of Law. Before joining the faculty, Magill clerked for Judge H. Harvie Wilkinson III of the US Court of Appeals for the Fourth Circuit and for Justice Ruth Bader Ginsburg of the US Supreme Court. In 2005–2006, she was a fellow in the law and public affairs program at Princeton University and in the spring of 2009, she was the Roscoe Pound Visiting Professor of Law at Harvard Law School.

**Jerry L. Mashaw** is Sterling Professor of Law and Management at Yale University. His award-winning books include *Bureaucratic Justice* (1983), *The Struggle for Auto Safety* (with David Harfst, 1990), and *Greed, Chaos, and Governance: Using Public Choice to Improve Public Law* (1997). Professor Mashaw is a founding member and past president of the National Academy of Social Insurance; a fellow of the National Academy of Arts and Sciences, and was founding co-editor (with O.E. Williamson) of the *Journal of Law, Economics and Organization*.

**Jean Massot** retired as a member of the French Conseil d'Etat in 2001, where his four-decade career concluded as the President of the Section des Finances. Today, former President Massot is a member of France's independent data protection agency, the Commission Nationale de l'Informatique et des Libertés (CNIL). He is also the author of numerous works on French administrative and constitutional law as well as legal history and politics. Among his several books are *Chef de l'état et chef de gouvernement* (2008), *Le Conseil d'Etat, 1799–1999* (1999) (co-editor with Thierry Girardot), and *Alternance et cohabitation sous la Vème République* (1997). He is a graduate of the Institut d'études politiques (Sciences-Po, Paris) and the Ecole National d'Administration (ENA), and holds a doctorate in law from the University of Paris.

**Thomas W. Merrill** is the Charles Evans Hughes Professor at Columbia Law School. He has also taught at Yale Law School and Northwestern University and served as a Deputy US Solicitor General. He specializes in property, environmental law, administrative law, eminent domain, and the US Supreme Court. Professor Merrill has published dozens of articles in law reviews, including the *Columbia Law Review*, *Harvard Law Review*, and *Yale Law Journal*. He has co-authored several textbooks, generally dealing with the laws of property. He received a BA in politics, philosophy and economics from Oxford University where he was a Rhodes Scholar and a JD from the University of Chicago Law School. He was a law clerk for Judge David L. Bazelon of the DC Circuit Court of Appeals and former Supreme Court Justice Harry Blackman.

**Giulio Napolitano** is Full Professor of Public Law at Roma Tre University and a Member of the Board of Directors of the EGPL – European Group of Public Law. He is a regular visiting professor in the Max-Planck-Institut für ausländisches öffentliches

Recht und Völkerrecht at Heidelberg; in 2008 he was program affiliate scholar in the School of Law of New York University. He has published five books and more than one hundred articles and book chapters on comparative administrative law, law and economics, regulation, and general theory of administrative law. Among his recent publications are: ‘Sul futuro delle scienze del diritto pubblico: variazioni su una lezione tedesca in terra Americana’ (Rivista trimestrale di diritto pubblico, 2010); *Analisi economica del diritto pubblico* (2009); *Diritto amministrativo comparato* (2007); ‘Les biens publics et les “tragedies de l’interet commun”’ (*Droit administratif*, 2007); ‘Towards a European Legal Order for Services of General Economic Interest’ (*European Public Law*, 2005).

**Fernanda G. Nicola** is an Associate Professor of Law at the Washington College of Law, American University. Her research and teaching interests are in the field of comparative law, European Union law and local government law. She was an intern at the European Parliament in the Civil Rights and Civil Liberties Committee and at the Council of Europe. Prior to coming to American University, she received a Ph.D. in Comparative Law from Trento University (Italy) and her SJD from Harvard Law School where she was a recipient of the Macini Prize and the Fellowship on Justice, Welfare and Economics sponsored by the Wetherhead Center of International Affairs.

**John Ohnesorge** teaches administrative law, business organization law, Chinese law, and law and economic development at the University of Wisconsin Law School, where he also directs the law school’s East Asian Legal Studies Center, and co-chairs the Wisconsin China Initiative. Professor Ohnesorge received his bachelor’s degree from St Olaf college (1985), his JD from the University of Minnesota Law School (1989), and his SJD from the Harvard Law School (2002). He has lived and worked in China and South Korea, travels frequently to the region, and has published widely on Asian legal systems and the role of law in economic development.

**Daniel R. Ortiz** is the John Allan Love Professor of Law at the University of Virginia School of Law, where he has taught since 1985. He teaches and writes in the fields of administrative law, constitutional law, election law, and legal theory. He is a graduate of Yale College, Oxford University, and Yale Law School. Before teaching, Ortiz clerked for Judge Stephen G. Breyer of the US Court of Appeals for the First Circuit and for Justice Lewis F. Powell, Jr of the US Supreme Court. In 1991 and 1994–96, he was a visiting professor at the University of Southern California Gould School of Law and, in 1999, at UC Berkeley Boalt Hall School of Law.

**Nicholas Parrillo** is an Associate Professor at Yale Law School. His interests are in administrative law, public management, government contracting, and American legal history. He has published articles on the US government’s use of privateers during the 19th century and on its relationship to its contractors during World War II. He holds a JD from Yale and has been a recipient of the NYU Golieb Fellowship in Legal History and of Yale’s Whiting Fellowship in the Humanities.

**Mariana Mota Prado** is an Assistant Professor at the Faculty of Law of the University of Toronto. She received her LL.B. from the University of São Paulo, and her LL.M. and JSD from Yale Law School. In 2004, she worked for the Private Participation in Infrastructure Database Project at the World Bank, and in 2005 she was a fellow of the

Olin Center for Law, Economics and Public Policy at Yale Law School. In 2004–2006 Mariana was tutor-in-law at Yale Law School. From 2000 to 2007, she was a researcher for the Law and Democracy Project, Brazilian Center of Analysis and Planning (CEBRAP) in Brazil. Her scholarship focuses on law and development, infrastructure regulation and administrative law.

**Dorit Rubinstein Reiss** received her law degree from the Hebrew University in Jerusalem, Israel, and is currently an Associate Professor in UC Hastings College of the Law, after completing her Ph D with the Jurisprudence and Social Policy Department in the University of California, Berkeley. Professor Reiss's work examines agency accountability in its various forms. She has written on various topics related to agency accountability in the utility sector in the UK, France and Sweden, on the accountability of the United States' Internal Revenue Service and on other topics in US administrative law, and is currently working on projects examining the California Public Utility Commission and estoppel. She teaches in the areas of torts, comparative law, administrative law and law and politics.

**Irma E. Sandoval** is Professor at the Institute for Social Research at the National Autonomous University of Mexico (UNAM) and Director of the Laboratory for the Documentation and Analysis of Corruption and Transparency of the UNAM ([www.corrupcion.unam.mx](http://www.corrupcion.unam.mx)). She is a member of Mexico's National System of Researchers, Level I and recipient of the 2009 Manuel Espinosa Yglesias award. She holds a doctorate in politics from the University of California, Santa Cruz and a Masters degree in Latin American Studies from the UNAM. She is an expert in transparency, corruption control, democratization, public policy and political economy and has worked as a consultant at the World Bank, the UNDP, the Open Society Institute and the Budget Accountability Project. She has published over a dozen articles and book chapters in peer-reviewed journals and edited volumes, including the *Administrative Law Review*, *Revista Mexicana de Sociología*, *Revista Argumentos*, *Perfiles Latinoamericanos* and *Fondo de Cultura Económica*. Her most recent books are: *Corrupción y transparencia: debatiendo los límites entre el Estado, mercado y sociedad* (2009) and *Economía Política de la Liberalización Financiera en México, Crisis, Rentismo y Opacidad* (forthcoming).

**Johannes Saurer** holds a position as Akademischer Rat at the University of Bayreuth. He received his first law degree from the University of Tuebingen, his Doctor juris from the University of Bayreuth and his LL.M. from Yale Law School. Currently he works on his *Habilitation* thesis on the foundations of European administrative law. His publications include articles on German and European constitutional and administrative law and the book *Die Funktionen der Rechtsverordnung* (2005).

**Kim Lane Scheppele** is the Laurence S. Rockefeller Professor of Sociology and Public Affairs in the University Center for Human Values and the Woodrow Wilson School at Princeton University, where she is also the Director of the Program in Law and Public Affairs. In 2009–2010, she was the George W. Crawford Visiting Professor of Law and Robina Foundation Senior Fellow at Yale Law School. Scheppele specializes in comparative public law, particularly in East-Central Europe and in the former Soviet Union. Her work has been supported by multiple grants from the American National Science Foundation and has appeared in numerous social science and law journals.

**Martin Shapiro** is James W. and Isabel Coffroth Professor of Law at the University of California, Berkeley, School of Law where he teaches American and comparative constitutional and administrative law and EU law in the jurisprudence and social policy program. He was formerly a Professor of Government at Harvard and of Political Science on three UC campuses and has held numerous visiting appointments in European universities. His writings include *Law and Politics in the Supreme Court* (1964), *Courts: A Political and Comparative Analysis* (1986) and *Law, Politics and Judicialization* (with Alec Stone Sweet) (2002).

**Bernardo Sordi** teaches history of law at the School of Law of the University of Florence, where he is the Director of the Centre for the History of Modern Legal Thought. He is a member of the editorial board of the review *Quaderni fiorentini*, produced by the Centre and coordinator of the Ph.D. program in 'Global law: history and theory'. His research interests concern constitutional and administrative history in the modern and contemporary age. He has over 60 publications including: *Giustizia e amministrazione nell'Italia liberale. La formazione della nozione di interesse legittimo* (1985), *Tra Weimar e Vienna: Amministrazione pubblica e teoria giuridica nel primo dopoguerra* (1987); *L'amministrazione illuminata: Riforma delle comunità e progetti di costituzione nella Toscana leopoldina* (1991); *Storia del diritto amministrativo* (with Luca Mannori), 3rd edition (2004).

**Lorne Sossin** is the Dean of Osgoode Hall Law School. He was formerly a Professor with the Faculty of Law at the University of Toronto where he taught courses in administrative and constitutional law, the regulation of professions, civil litigation, public policy and the judicial process. He is a former Associate Dean of the Faculty, and is the inaugural Director of the Centre for the Legal Profession at the Faculty of Law, University of Toronto. Lorne Sossin was a law clerk to former Chief Justice Antonio Lamer of the Supreme Court of Canada, a former Associate in Law at Columbia Law School and a former litigation lawyer with the firm of Borden & Elliot (now Borden Ladner Gervais). His recent publications include *Parliamentary Democracy in Crisis* (2009) (co-edited with Peter Russell); *Administrative Law in Context* (2008) (co-edited with Colleen Flood); *Access to Care, Access to Justice: The Legal Debate over Private Health Insurance in Canada* (2005) (co-edited with Colleen Flood and Kent Roach), and *Dilemmas of Solidarity: Rethinking Redistribution in the Canadian Federation* (2006) (co-edited with Sujit Choudhry and Jean-Francois Gaudreault-Desbiens).

**Jonathan B. Wiener** is William R. and Thomas L. Perkins Professor of Law, as well as professor of environmental policy and professor of public policy studies, at Duke University. He has been a University Fellow of Resources for the Future (RFF) since 2002. In 2008 he served as President of the Society for Risk Analysis (SRA), and in 2003 he received the Chauncey Starr Young Risk Analyst Award from the SRA. He has been a visiting professor at Harvard Law School, the University of Chicago Law School, and Sciences Po and EHESS in Paris. His books include *Risk vs. Risk* (with John Graham, 1995); *Reconstructing Climate Policy* (with Richard Stewart, 2003); and *The Reality of Precaution: Comparing Risk Regulation in the U.S. and Europe* (with others, 2010). He has served in the US Government at the President's Council of Economic Advisers (CEA), the Department of Justice, the White House Office of Science and Technology Policy,

and the Americorps National Service program. He served as a law clerk to Judge Stephen G. Breyer on the US Court of Appeals in Boston, and to Judge Jack B. Weinstein on the US District Court in Brooklyn, New York. He received his AB (1984, economics) and JD (1987) from Harvard University, where he was an editor of the *Harvard Law Review*.

**Jiunn-rong Yeh** is Distinguished Professor of Law and Director of Policy and Law Center for Sustainable Development (PLES) at the College of Law, National Taiwan University. He received an LL.B. and an LL.M. from the National Taiwan University and an LL.M. and a JSD from Yale Law School. He has been substantially involved in many constitutional, legislative and regulatory issues in Taiwan, including drafting of several major legislative bills, such as the Freedom of Information Act, the Administrative Procedural Act, the Superfund Law and the Greenhouse Gases Control Act. Professor Yeh's extensive publications cover topics such as environmental law and policy, global environmental sustainability, constitutional change, and globalization and regulatory process. He received an Award for Excellence in Research from the National Science Council. Professor Yeh joined the Cabinet of Taiwan as a Minister without Portfolio in 2002, in charge of government reform and inter-ministerial coordination. In 2005, Professor Yeh was elected Secretary-General of the mission-oriented National Assembly that approved the constitutional revision proposals by the Legislative Yuan.

**Tom Zwart** is a Professor of Law at Utrecht School of Law and the Director of the Netherlands School of Human Rights Research, a research institute in which five Dutch universities take part. He specializes in comparative administrative and constitutional law, as well as human rights. He has been a visiting scholar at a number of universities across the world, including Sciences-Po in Paris, Cambridge University in England and Tsinghua University and Zhejiang University in China. Prior to taking up his position in Utrecht, he served as the Head of the European and Legal Affairs Department of the Dutch Home Office. In this capacity he acted as a senior counsel to the Dutch Deputy Prime Minister, the Council of Ministers of the EU and the Council of Europe.

---

## Acknowledgements

---

This volume is the outgrowth of a conference on comparative administrative law organized by the editors and held at Yale Law School in May 2009 with the generous support of the Oscar M. Ruebhausen Fund. We are extremely grateful for the support of the Yale Law School and the Ruebhausen Fund for supporting both the conference and the publication of this volume.

It would have been impossible for us to publish a collective volume of this magnitude and ambition without the extensive assistance of others. We are especially grateful to Athanasios Psygkas for research help and other assistance, as well as to Cathy Orcutt for managing the logistics of both the conference and the edited volume with her usual competence and aplomb. We also want to thank the authors of the chapters for keeping to our deadlines, responding to our comments, and providing us with a collection of diverse and fascinating approaches to the topic. We look forward to further collaborative efforts.

Susan Rose-Ackerman  
Peter L. Lindseth

---

# Comparative administrative law: an introduction

*Susan Rose-Ackerman and Peter L. Lindseth*

---

Administrative law exists at the interface between the state and society – between civil servants and state institutions, on the one hand, and citizens, business firms, organized groups, and non-citizens, on the other. Civil service law and bureaucratic organization charts and rules provide an essential background, but our emphasis is on the law's fundamental role in framing the way individuals and organizations test and challenge the legitimacy of the modern state outside of the electoral process. There are two broad tasks – protecting individuals against an overreaching state and providing external checks that enhance the democratic accountability and competence of the administration.

Public law is the product of statutory, constitutional, and judicial choices over time; it blends constitutional and administrative concerns. The Germans speak of administrative law as 'concretized' constitutional law, and Americans often call it 'applied' constitutional law. The English, with no written constitution, refer to 'natural justice' and, more recently, to the European Convention on Human Rights (ECHR). The French tradition of *droit administratif* contains within it a whole conceptual vocabulary – *dualité de juridiction, acte administratif, service public* – that has been deeply influential in many parts of the world (notably francophone Africa, the Middle East, and Latin America). East Asia has a long tradition of centralized, hierarchical, and bureaucratic rule – a sort of 'administrative law' *avant la lettre*. And yet, in forging its own modern variants, East Asia has also drawn on Western (and particularly German and US) models.

Administrative law is one of the 'institutions' of modern government, in the sense that economists and political scientists often use that term (see, for example, North 1990: 3–5, March and Olsen 1989, 1998: 948). It is thus amenable to comparative political and historical study, not just purely legal analysis. Employing this broad perspective, we seek to illuminate both the historical legacies and the present-day political and economic realities that continue to shape the field as we proceed into the twenty-first century.

The distinction between public and private is essential to administrative law, a distinction that common law jurisdictions long sought to downplay by claiming that the same courts and legal principles should resolve both wholly private disputes and those involving the state. Nevertheless, even in the common law world, debates over the proper role and unique prerogatives of state actors are pervasive. Some scholars still assume that one can compartmentalize regulatory activities and actors into either a public or a private sphere. This may be analytically convenient, but it does not fit the increasingly blurred boundary between state and society. Recent developments have also strained another familiar distinction – between justice and administration. In Europe, for example, courts regularly apply the principle of proportionality – if a policy interferes with a right, then it must be designed in the least restrictive way. As a result, courts have begun to impose standards on government policymaking, at least when rights are at stake.

International legal developments are increasingly influencing domestic regulatory and administrative bodies. The project in Global Administrative Law centered at New York

## 2 *Comparative administrative law*

University (Kingsbury et al. 2005), focuses on the administrative law of international organizations, such as the World Trade Organization. Nevertheless, it often draws on domestic models of the administrative process for inspiration. Our focus here is complementary. This collection emphasizes how the practices of multinational and regional bodies have both emerged out of and affected the administrative process in established states.

This volume attempts to capture the complexity of the field while also distilling certain key elements for comparative study. Because administrative law is intimately bound up with the development of the modern state, we begin with a set of historical reflections on its interactions with social and political change over the last two centuries. The remaining parts are broadly thematic. The first concentrates on the relationship between administrative and constitutional law – uncertain, contested, and deeply essential. We next focus on a key aspect of this uneasy relationship – administrative independence with its manifold implications for separation of powers, democratic self-government, and the boundary between law, politics, and policy. The next two parts highlight the tensions between impartial expertise and public accountability. They cover, first, internal processes of decision-making (including transparency, participation, political oversight, and policy or impact analysis), and, second, external legal controls on administrative decision-making (that is, ‘administrative litigation’ writ large). The final part considers how administrative law is shaping and is being shaped by the changing boundaries of the state. This part confronts two basic structural issues: the evolving boundary between public and private, and the similarly evolving boundary between the domestic and transnational regulatory orders. In considering this second question, the chapters focus on the EU, as the most evolved transnational regulatory order now operating.

### **1. Administrative law as historical institution**

As Bernardo Sordi (chapter 1) stresses in his opening contribution, the emergence of administrative law in Europe was very much a modern phenomenon. It was tied to the increasing ‘specificity and subjectivity’ of public administrative power since the end of the eighteenth century. Sordi’s fundamental claim is that ‘administrative power’ and ‘administrative law’ emerged contemporaneously – in other words, the new authority and its legal limitation arose together. This conjunction arguably holds true outside of Europe as well. As John Ohnesorge (chapter 5) notes, in East Asia, for example, the term ‘administrative law’ was unknown; nevertheless, the prevailing traditional system of government – with its commands from higher to lower level officials; its proliferation of regulatory mandates; its definition of competences; and its ambition for a ‘professional, disciplined, meritocratic, and rule-bound’ body of public servants – suggests that East Asia may well have been something of a pioneer.

But traditional East Asian law arguably lacked a realm of ‘private’ right distinct from the realm of public governance. In contrast, Sordi stresses that old regime monarchies in Europe ruled through a corporatist system of privileges and jurisdictions grounded in conceptions of right (notably ‘property’) that we would today clearly see as private. It was precisely the progressive extrication of ‘public’ authority from this corporatist old regime, as well as the development of a distinct corps of public servants to pursue and defend these new public prerogatives, that marked the emergence of administrative modernity in the Western world.